UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

BOYD FULTON, Plaintiff

Civil Action No.2004 CV 11234 MEL

v.

TOWN OF HULL, MASSACHUSETTS, Defendant

AFFIDAVIT OF MARK D. STERN IN SUPPORT OF TENANT'S MOTION FOR AN AWARD OF ATTORNEYS' FEES

I Mark D. Stern swear under the pain and penalty of perjury that the following statements are true, accurate and complete, and known to me personally unless otherwise indicated to be known to me only on information and belief.

- 1. I am a graduate of Brown University (1966) and Harvard Law School (1969). I graduated both institutions cum laude and with honors. I was admitted to the following bars on the following dates:
 - A. Bar of the Commonwealth of Massachusetts (April 1970);
 - B. Bar of the United States District Court for the District of Massachusetts (April 1970);
 - C. Bar of the First Circuit Court of Appeals (September 1976);
 - D. Bar of the Second Circuit Court of Appeals (January 1980); and
 - E. Bar of the Supreme Court of the United States (October 1982).
- 2. I have been actively engaged in the practice of law since 1972, specializing in litigation, and in particular housing law, employment law and civil rights litigation. Before that time I was an Instructor at Wellesley College, a Teaching Assistant at Harvard College, and Director of Housing,

Education and Family Services for the Mayor's Office of Human Rights of the City of Boston.

- 3. I am presently in solo private practice. Previously I have had one associate, and before that I was a partner in the law firms of Goldstein, Pressman, Stern and Hiller, Cambridge, MA, and Galvin and Stern, and Stern and Zack in East Boston, MA.
- 4. For most of the time that I have been in practice, I have concentrated on complex litigation, frequently on the other side from the largest and most prestigious law firms in the Boston area. During that time I have had the opportunity to break new ground in a number of areas. In many of these cases I have garnered experience and demonstrated my abilities as an appellate advocate. I mention only a handful of these below.
 - A. In the areas of housing law rights, in 1982 my clients in the <u>Vieira</u> case won the first significant damage judgment (nearly \$2,000,000) for asymptomatically lead poisoned children; this case settled after a successful appellate oral argument.
 - B. A decade earlier, in the two <u>Kargman</u> cases at the First Circuit Court of Appeals, my clients prevailed on questions of federal supremacy related to rent control regulation, and on reviving the common fund legal fee doctrine.
 - C. A decade later, in the 1990's I obtained a contempt judgment in the <u>Anderson</u> case for more than a hundred, most elderly tenants in Brookline after several successful defenses of appeals taken to the Supreme Judicial Court and Single Justices thereof.
 - D. In the area of employment law, in 1983 my client in the <u>Irvine</u> case, a teacher who assisted her students in filing sex harassment charges against her supervisor/their professor, won \$350,000 on account of the ensuing retaliation she suffered.
 - E. In 2000 my client in the <u>Cummings</u> case won nearly \$2,000,000 on an age discrimination claim, upheld by the First Circuit Court of Appeals.
 - F. In 2006 I won an appeal in the case of <u>Moore Trust v. Din-Dayal</u> obtaining a judgment for my client in a retaliatory eviction case; reconsideration of the discrimination claim, damages and attorneys fees are pending decision.

- G. In the area of labor union democracy, in the early 1980's my clients in the Crowley case obtained pre-election relief for Teamster dissidents who incumbent officers prevented from running against them. On certiorari, the U.S. Supreme Court limited the right to such relief, but expanded pre-existing rights.
- G. In 1988 my client in the <u>Doty</u> case was awarded a \$550,000 jury verdict against a local union and its officials who had intimidated and inhibited him from advocating for democratic changes in the union. The Verdict was sustained on appeal.
- Н. In an earlier appeal on behalf of Mr. Doty I established a three year statute of limitations for LMRDA violations in the First Circuit despite the fact that other circuits had held the statute of limitations was six months; the decision was later cited in a Supreme Court case adopting the three year statute of limitations.
- I. In other areas of labor law, my clients in <u>U.E. v. Pleasant Street Corporation</u>, union retirees, were granted the right to proceed under ERISA against a foreign corporation which owned and controlled their defunct, former employer for health and life insurance benefits.
- J. My clients in the Boston Jobs Coalition case successfully defended the City of Boston's resident and women's quota's for construction work before the Massachusetts Supreme Judicial Court.
- K. My client in <u>In re Walter</u> established the right of a husband to custody of his wife's son without having to prove his paternity.
- 5. I have taught litigation skills for the New England School of Law, the Advocacy Training Institute, the Massachusetts Lawyers Guild, and the Suffolk Law School Community Education Project. I have also put on presentations for the Massachusetts Association of Trial Lawyers and the Massachusetts Lawyers Guild, and at Northeastern University Law School, Suffolk University Law School, Harvard Law School, Boston College Law School and Boston University Law School. I served on the Advisory Board for the Advocacy Training Institute in 1984 et seq., have served on the Workers Rights Board of Jobs with Justice, and am pending an appointment as a Commissioner for the Supreme Judicial Court/Board of Bar Overseers.

- 6. I have chaired national committees of one bar association for several years in both the housing and labor/employment areas, respectively from 1974-76 in the housing area and 1977-80 in the labor/employment area.
- 7. I have regularly received both referrals from individuals and institutions, and requests for assistance from attorneys in housing litigation, employment and civil rights/discrimination litigation.
- 8. I have done two cases for Mr. Fulton, the present case and the final piece of a Civil Service case. As discussed below, my work on the two cases began simultaneously in June, 2004. Before that I had consulted with him in December 2003 and January 2004 on the same matters. I do not have any expectation that my relationship with this client will result in my obtaining any future, lucrative business.
- 9. I have maintained detailed time records of the work done for my client, and have reproduced them in a typed format in Addendum A hereto. I have reviewed those statements and certify that they are accurate.
- 10. The hours I expended and detailed on the Addendum hereto generally include only time that I was working to produce a pleading, correspondence or the like. The Addendum does not, in the exercise of billing judgment, include time I spent thinking about the case, and talking to other people about issues in the case and how to approach them.
- 11. For the purpose of this motion I have sub-categorized the services I rendered for Mr. Fulton into several categories, and by this motion request no fees or fees at different rates for each subcategory of work. These subcategories are as follows:

4

¹ My work on the Civil Service matter concluded after a motion hearing in November 2004.

- A. SERVICES RENDERED ONLY ON THE VACATION PAY CLAIM AND/OR HIS FEE APPLICATION: Where the services rendered would have had to have been rendered in precisely the same way as they were had the Plaintiff sought only partial summary judgment on the claim on which he prevailed, I have included the time expended (and expenses where applicable) at the full market rate (\$450). This would include services such as attending the hearing on the motion, and reading the decision of the Court.
- B. SERVICES RENDERED ON THE SUMMARY JUDGMENT MOTION: Where the services rendered can be identified as working on the claim on which the Plaintiff has prevailed, and only one other claims simultaneously, I have included the time expended (and expenses where applicable) at half of the full market rate (\$225). This would include services such as preparing the motion for partial summary judgment and supporting materials, which referenced two claims, one on which Plaintiff has prevailed and the other which remains to be tried at a later date.
- C. SERVICES RENDERED ON THIS CASE GENERALLY: Where the services rendered can only be identified as working on this case as a whole, and cannot be identified as being directed to one or two particular claims, I have included the time expended (and expenses where applicable) at one third the full market rate (\$150). This would include services such as preparing the Complaint in this action.
- D. SERVICES RENDERED ON BOTH HIS CASES: Where the services can be identified only as relating to representing the client generally, I have included the time expended (and expenses where applicable) at twenty two percent of the full market rate (\$100). This would include such services as meeting with or otherwise communicating with the client, or opposing

counsel, and reviewing documents provided with an eye to consideration of all his claims..

- E. SERVICES RENDERED ONLY IN THE CIVIL SERVICE PROCEEDING, AND/OR ON YET PENDING CLAIMS IN THIS CASE: Finally, where the services rendered can only be specifically identified as relating to the Civil Service proceeding or claims in this proceeding on which the Plaintiff has yet to prevail, I have included the time expended (and expenses where applicable) and indicated there is no current charge for them.
- 12. I commenced working on this proceeding on an hourly basis, but Mr. Fulton discontinued paying me some time ago, and I have worked since then on a <u>de facto</u> contingency fee basis, that is, only had an expectation of payment if he won some or all of his claims.
- 13. Care was taken throughout the entirety of the litigation to assure that the tasks required to be done were allocated between lawyers and paralegal staff to accomplish a maximum of economies and the best possible results. These tasks were performed by my former associate, Donna Conley, and former paralegal assistant, Elizabeth Clemons. I personally coordinated all the aforementioned persons' efforts in such a fashion to insure that there was no duplication of effort, and to assure that the best possible case was presented to this Court. In my view none of the services rendered by any of these persons and none of the costs incurred duplicated any services rendered or costs incurred by any other person.
- 14. Appended hereto are copies of a number of affidavits relating to my experience, skill, and reputation as an attorney, and what constitutes a reasonable hourly rate for my services in this case. They are from Attorneys Thomas Shapiro (Exhibit A hereto), Barry Klickstein (Exhibit B hereto), John Mason, Jr. (Exhibit D hereto), Andrew Fischer (Exhibit E

hereto), Judith Somberg (Exhibit F hereto), and Benjamin Hiller (Exhibit G hereto).²

15. For my services in this case I am advised that the rate of \$450 is at the far low end of what attorneys of my experience, reputation and skill charge for litigation services in the Boston area.. I have used the base rate of \$225 for Attorney Conley, and \$40 per hour for paralegal services provided by my office. Their respective resumes are appended hereto as Exhibits H and I.

16. The filing fee incurred by Mr. Fulton himself was \$150; a copy of the receipt for said filing fee is appended as Exhibit J hereto. Said fee would have been incurred had he pursued only the sole claim on which he has prevailed to date. The costs my office expended on Mr. Fulton's behalf totaled \$311.58 and are detailed in the Addendum hereto. These costs should be pro-rated: that is, one third should be allowed at this time. To this end I have credited two thirds thereof (\$207.72) on my bill as if there were a payment of such an amount.

Signed this 5th day of September 2006

Mark D. Stern

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I hereby certify that on September 6, 2006 I caused to be served a copy of the above document on the plaintiff-appellee by mailing a copy, first class, postage prepaid to James B. Lampke, Town Counsel, Town of Hull, 115 North Street, Hingham, MA 02043

² As the headings indicate, I procured them for use in other cases and with the exception of the Hiller Affidavit, I recently employed in a state court appellate procedure in which my client prevailed after an adverse trial court decision on her housing discrimination and retaliation claims.

ADDENDUM

September 05, 2006

In Reference To: Boyd Fulton v. Town of Hull, Massachusetts
United States District Court/District of Massachusetts
Civil Action No. 2004 CV 11234 MEL

Professional Services

		Hrs/Rate	Amount
12/23/2003	ALL SLIPS ARE MARK STERN UNLESS OTHERWISE INDICATED TO BE ATTORNEY DONNA CONLEY OR PARALEGAL WORKER ELIZABETH CLEMONS	0.70 100.00/hr	70.00
	Review papers; do research and write client		
1/14/2004	Extended telephone call with client; telephone call with Galen Gilbert; e-mail from Gilbert; more faxes and telephone calls with client and Gilbert	1.40	NO CHARGE
6/11/2004	Meeting with client and Donna Conley	2.00	NO CHARGE
6/14/2004	Documents from client; telephone message from client	0.10 100.00/hr	10.00
6/15/2004	Two e-mails from Donna Conley; telephone message from client	0.15 100.00/hr	15.00
6/18/2004	CONLEY Legal research; telephone call client (RSVP)	0.10 50.00/hr	5.00
	Work with Donna Conley re: claims; telephone message to client	0.15 100.00/hr	15.00
6/20/2004	Telephone call client	0.05 100.00/hr	5.00
6/21/2004	CONLEY Meeting with client; request personnel file and letter to Town/demand	0.30 50.00/hr	15.00
	Meeting at office with Donna Conley and client; revise draft and send letter to Hull	0.90 100.00/hr	90.00

Boyd Fultor	ı		Page 2
		Hrs/Rate	Amount
7/6/2004	Telephone call to client, left message; telephone call office of Town of Hull's counsel	0.15 100.00/hr	15.00
7/7/2004	Personnel file from Hull and letter	0.10 100.00/hr	10.00
7/8/2004	Review file and write to client; letter from Town	0.40 100.00/hr	40.00
7/13/2004	Telephone call client (RSVP) and letter to client	0.10 100.00/hr	10.00
7/26/2004	Multiple calls to client for update	0.10 100.00/hr	10.00
7/27/2004	Telephone call client	0.15 100.00/hr	15.00
7/29/2004	CONLEY Work on Amended Complaint; legal research; review client's materials	0.30 75.00/hr	22.50
7/30/2004	Review files from client; telephone call client, left message; work with Donna; fax and call from Civil Service (file) and telephone call to client and review of file; telephone calls to and from Civil Service Commission (Bob Smith); fax to hm	0.75	NO CHARGE
	Telephone messages to and from client	0.05 100.00/hr	5.00
	CONLEY Work with Mark D. Stern on review of civil service files	0.10	NO CHARGE
8/3/2004	Telephone calls to Civil Service persons; letter to client and review and organize files	0.55	NO CHARGE
8/17/2004	Review materials from client and telephone call to client, left message	0.20	NO CHARGE
8/25/2004	Telephone message from client; telephone message to client, reply	0.10 100.00/hr	10.00
9/1/2004	Letters from and to client	0.25 100.00/hr	25.00
9/8/2004	Telephone call client; review file; telephone call Donna Conley	0.20 100.00/hr	20.00

Boyd Fultor			Page 3
		Hrs/Rate	Amount
9/10/2004	CONLEY Review personnel file and pay records; meeting with client re: federal Complaint	1.50 75.00/hr	112.50
	Client at office and telephone calls with Lampke (with Donna Conley)	0.70 150.00/hr	105.00
9/15/2004	CONLEY Revisions to Amended Complaint; review of client's synopsis	1.50 75.00/hr	112.50
9/16/2004	Letter and agreement to client; work with Donna Conley re: claims	0.40 150.00/hr	60.00
	CONLEY Memo to file re: issues of law and draft one count	0.30 75.00/hr	22.50
9/20/2004	Review draft Complaint and notes from Donna Conley	0.45 150.00/hr	67.50
9/21/2004	CONLEY Discuss legal theories of Complaint with Mark D. Stern and revise Amended Complaint; more on revising Amended Complaint and prepare waiver of service of summons	1.00 75.00/hr	75.00
	Work on Amended Complaint and research	1.20 150.00/hr	180.00
9/22/2004	Work on letter to Town attorney and Amended Complaint; telephone call with Fulton	0.40 150.00/hr	60.00
9/29/2004	Telephone call client	0.35 150.00/hr	52.50
10/1/2004	Review docket; messages for client	0.05 150.00/hr	7.50
10/3/2004	CONLEY Left message for client; e-mail to Mark D. Stern re: on call	0.20	NO CHARGE
10/4/2004	CONLEY Revise Complaint; two telephone calls with client and Mark D. Stern; revise letter to Lampke	1.30 75.00/hr	97.50
	Telephone call client, with Donna Conley re: on call claim; research	0.65	NO CHARGE
10/11/2004	Correspondence to client	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00

Boyd Fulton	1		Page 4
		Hrs/Rate	Amount
10/18/2004	CONLEY Letter to National Weather Service requesting snow forecasts	0.10	NO CHARGE
10/27/2004	Telephone call with Attorney Lampke; research	0.30 75.00/hr	22.50
11/1/2004	CONLEY Letter to client re: Civil Service Commission hearing	0.10	NO CHARGE
11/15/2004	Telephone calls with Attorney Lampke; faxes to and from Attorney Lampke; pull out files; telephone call from client and fax	0.40 100.00/hr	40.00
11/16/2004	Preparation with client; Civil Service hearing; travel; letter to client	2.50	NO CHARGE
11/23/2004	Client package in mail; telephone call client (RSVP); telephone call client and telephone review of papers	0.45 100.00/hr	45.00
11/30/2004	Review Donna Conley's research	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00
12/6/2004	Telephone call Lampke	0.05 150.00/hr	7.50
12/8/2004	Telephone call from Lampke, extend to 12/14; fax	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00
12/14/2004	Answer and letter from Lampke; letter to client	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
12/15/2004	Review Answer and annotate Complaint	0.35 150.00/hr	52.50
12/16/2004	Discuss case with Donna Conley; draft letter to Lampke; letter to client; telephone call client, left message	1.70 150.00/hr	255.00
	CONLEY Draft reply letter to Lampke re: Amended Complaint; letter to client; review Defendant's Answer	1.40 75.00/hr	105.00
	CONLEY Draft Plaintiff's Rule 16 Certification; letter to client; draft Joint Statement and Initial Disclosures	1.10 75.00/hr	82.50
	Letter to client re: Certification and draft Joint Statement	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
12/21/2004	Telephone call from client; telephone call Donna Conley; telephone call Lampke (RSVP)	0.65 150.00/hr	97.50

Boyd Fulton			Page 5
		Hrs/Rate	Amount
12/22/2004	Telephone call Lampke (RSVP) and letter to him; Answer to Counterclaims	0.55 150.00/hr	82.50
12/24/2004	Telephone call Lampke; fax from Lampke; review of file; telephone call with Donna Conley; research	0.40 150.00/hr	60.00
12/30/2004	Notice from Court	0.05 150.00/hr	7.50
1/3/2005	Fax from Lampke; mailing from client	0.15 150.00/hr	22.50
	CONLEY Review of documents from client; cover letter to Court (Local Rule 16 Certification); letter to client	0.30 75.00/hr	22.50
1/6/2005	CONLEY Telephone call with client and review of documents	0.70 75.00/hr	52.50
	Telephone call with client and with Donna Conley re: her work with client	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
1/10/2005	Draft Initial Disclosures and Joint Statement; review of documents; letter to Lampke	1.90 75.00/hr	142.50
1/13/2005	CONLEY Work with Mark D. Stern on Joint Statement and letter to client; letter to Lampke; Settlement and Demand draft	0.80 75.00/hr	60.00
	Work on letter to Lampke; telephone call to Lampke; letter to Fulton	0.45 150.00/hr	67.50
1/19/2005	Mailing from Lampke and to client with letter; telephone call client	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
1/24/2005	Telephone call client; letters to Civil Service Commission and client	0.70	NO CHARGE
	Joint Statement, demand letter and letter to client and multiple phone calls and faxes	0.70 150.00/hr	105.00
	CONLEY Three telephone calls client and with Mark D. Stern on demand letter and Joint Statement	2.70 75.00/hr	202.50
	CONLEY Correspondence to Civil Service Commission	0.10	NO CHARGE

Boyd Fulton			Page 6
		Hrs/Rate	Amount
1/25/2005	Fax from and two telephone calls to Lampke	0.30 150.00/hr	45.00
1/26/2005	Work on Amended Complaint with Donna Conley	0.30 150.00/hr	45.00
	CONLEY Revisions to Second Amended Complaint, Motion for Leave to File; look through and preparation for Initial Disclosure documents	0.70 75.00/hr	52.50
1/28/2005	Fax from client; call to him	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00
2/2/2005	Court; travel; review of file	1.65 150.00/hr	247.50
2/7/2005	Filings from Court	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00
2/14/2005	Order from Court	0.05 150.00/hr	7.50
2/15/2005	Telephone call Lampke; update and file Disclosures; do Rule 30B(6) Notice	0.85 150.00/hr	127.50
2/25/2005	Research; letter to Lampke	0.30 150.00/hr	45.00
3/4/2005	Telephone calls with Lampke; e-mail Baker and RSVP; telephone call from Baker; letters to Lampke and client	0.50 150.00/hr	75.00
	Offer of Settlement from Lampke; telephone calls to client; review file; telephone call Lampke	0.45 150.00/hr	67.50
	Letter to client; answer with copy to client; telephone call from client; call to Lampke (RSVP)	0.70 150.00/hr	105.00
	Letter and telephone calls (RSVP) to Lampke; fax from and telephone call to client (RSVP)	0.60 150.00/hr	90.00
3/21/2005	Telephone call with Lampke; e-mail Baker; message for Fulton; e-mail from Lampke and reply and mail to client	0.50 150.00/hr	75.00
3/22/2005	Answer Counterclaims and file	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
3/28/2005	Fax from and letter to client; second letter to client	0.25 150.00/hr	37.50

Boyd Fulton		Page 7
	Hrs/Rate	Amount
3/30/2005 Telephone calls with Lampke at office and home	0.15 150.00/hr	22.50
3/31/2005 Telephone call with Lampke; call to client, RSVP	0.30 150.00/hr	45.00
4/1/2005 Telephone call with Lampke; mailing form him and mailing and letter to client	0.40 150.00/hr	60.00
4/5/2005 Messages from and to client	0.10 150.00/hr	15.00
4/11/2005 Telephone call client re: settlement; letter to client	0.35 150.00/hr	52.50
5/6/2005 Review fax from client; send letter to client	0.25 150.00/hr	37.50
7/21/2005 Letter to client	0.15 150.00/hr	22.50
7/25/2005 Letter to client; research	0.15 225.00/hr	33.75
8/3/2005 Mail to client returned; telephone message to client	0.15 150.00/hr	22.50
8/10/2005 Letter from and reply to client	0.25 150.00/hr	37.50
8/11/2005 Telephone call Lampke (message)	0.05 150.00/hr	7.50
10/5/2005 Letter to client	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
1/12/2006 Letter to client	0.20 150.00/hr	30.00
3/7/2006 Letter from client and reply	0.40 150.00/hr	60.00
3/23/2006 Letter to client	0.30 150.00/hr	45.00
4/3/2006 Telephone call BBO for ethics opinion; review file; prepare affidavit and letter to client	1.35 150.00/hr	202.50

Boyd Fulton		Page 8
	Hrs/Rate	Amount
4/7/2006 Telephone message from client; letter to client	0.50 225.00/hr	112.50
5/1/2006 Letter to client	0.20 225.00/hr	45.00
5/2/2006 Telephone call client; review agreement, affidavit and Complaint with him	0.30 225.00/hr	67.50
5/5/2006 Affidavit from client; draft Motion and Memo; Review of Rule 56 & Local Rul work on Statement of Undisputed Facts	le; 1.70 225.00/hr	382.50
5/10/2006 Prepare Memo for Summary Judgment and Motion; telephone call with Dor Conley; research	nna 2.35 225.00/hr	528.75
5/11/2006 E-mail from Donna Conley and reply	0.20 225.00/hr	45.00
5/12/2006 Telephone call with Donna Conley and notes for file	0.30 225.00/hr	67.50
5/15/2006 E-mails from Court and letter to Court; telephone call with Donna Conley; for to Lampke	ax 0.60 225.00/hr	135.00
5/30/2006 Telephone call Lampke	0.30 225.00/hr	67.50
6/6/2006 Motion to Extend Time from Lampke	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50
6/8/2006 Review e-mails from Lampke	0.40 225.00/hr	90.00
6/9/2006 Send client letter	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50
6/15/2006 E-mails and research with Donna Conley	0.35 225.00/hr	78.75
6/19/2006 CLEMONS Letter to client re: hearing date/time	0.25 20.00/hr	5.00
Order from Court; letter to client and docket	0.15 450.00/hr	67.50
6/21/2006 E-mails from and to Lampke	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50

Boyd Fulton		Page 9
	Hrs/Rate	Amount
6/28/2006 Telephone call from Lampke's office; letter to Fulton	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50
CLEMONS Letter to client	0.10 20.00/hr	2.00
6/29/2006 Telephone call with Lampke re: new dates	0.15 450.00/hr	67.50
6/30/2006 Fax from Lampke; letter to client	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50
7/6/2006 Motion to Reschedule; Order from Court	0.15 450.00/hr	67.50
7/7/2006 Message from Fulton; message to him with e-mail; prepare agreement for after summary judgment hearing; telephone call with Lampke and fax from him	2.05 225.00/hr	461.25
7/10/2006 Telephone call from Lampke's office	0.05 225.00/hr	11.25
7/11/2006 Telephone call with Lampke; preparation for Court; calculations with Kathy Caruso; letter to client and call to Lampke (RSVP)	1.15 225.00/hr	258.75
Court and travel and preparation	1.65 450.00/hr	742.50
7/12/2006 Research FRE; e-mail from Court; telephone call with Lampke; draft letter to client	0.75 225.00/hr	168.75
7/13/2006 Review and revise letter to Court; telephone call/e-mail Lampke	0.40 225.00/hr	90.00
7/14/2006 Telephone calls Lampke (4 times)	0.10 225.00/hr	22.50
7/17/2006 Telephone call Lampke; divide draft into two letters and send to Lampke	0.50 225.00/hr	112.50
7/18/2006 Telephone call Lampke (RSVP) and reply telephone call; review and resend e-mail; telephone call Lampke	0.35 225.00/hr	78.75
7/19/2006 E-mail from Lampke	0.05 225.00/hr	11.25
7/20/2006 E-mail from Court and letter to client	0.15 225.00/hr	33.75

Boyd Fultor			Page	10
		Hrs/Rate	Amo	<u>unt</u>
8/4/2006	Telephone call from client	0.10 225.00/hr	22	.50
8/23/2006	Review Decision; telephone call with Donna Conley and send with letter to client	0.50 450.00/hr	225	.00
8/27/2006	Message from client re decision	0.05 450.00/hr	22.	.50
8/28/2006	Telephone call to client; draft Mark D. Stern Affidavit; review and edit time records; reduce fees for various categories unrelated or only partially related to favorable decision; Telephone call Peg Malt	2.55 450.00/hr	1,147	.50
8/29/2006	Revise draft Mark D. Stern Affidavit; draft Fee Memorandum	0.95 450.00/hr	427.	.50
8/30/2006	Telephone call Client; with Bookkeeper on expenses	0.20 450.00/hr	90.	.00
9/2/2006	With Peg Malt on time records	0.30 450.00/hr	135.	.00
9/4/2006	Review, correct and edit time records, Affidavit and Memo; draft motion and letter; Telephone call to Dick Bauer	2.45 450.00/hr	1,102.	.50
9/5/2006	Prepare materials for filing with Court, Gather Exhibits for Affidavit, Revise Affidavit to Exhibits; Finish Addendum to Affidavit	0.85 450.00/hr	382.	50
	For professional services rendered	75.00	\$12,349.	50
	Additional Charges :			
6/4/2004	Filing Fee paid by client		150.	00
12/1/2004	Photocopies		19.	95
	Postage		4.	52
2/1/2005	Copying costs		181.	80
	Postage		28.	50
	Subpoenas		14.	65
4/1/2005	Photocopies		9.	60
	Postage		3.	56

Boyd Fulton	Page 1	1
	Amoun	<u>1t</u>
9/2/2006 Timeslips data entry	49.00	0
Total costs	\$461.58	8
Total amount of this bill	\$12,811.0	8
9/5/2006 Credit for two-thirds of expenses (See Affidavit of Mark D. Stern for explanation)	(\$207.72	2)
Total payments and adjustments	(\$207.72	2)
Balance due	\$12,603.36	– 6

ADDELL ATE DIVISION

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT NORTHERN DISTRICT

CASE NO. 9937M
) TRIAL COURT) CAMBRIDGE DIVISION OF
) THE DISTRICT COURT DEPT
) NO. 0452-SU-0672

AFFIDAVIT OF THOMAS G. SHAPIRO

- I am a practicing lawyer in Boston, Massachusetts with the firm of Shapiro Haber & Urmy
 LLP.
- 2. I have known Mark D. Stern for nearly forty years, since we were classmates together in the fall of 1966 at Harvard Law School, Class of 1969.
- 3. I have had various occasions over the years to discuss cases with him.
- 4. I believe him to be a first rate attorney with an excellent reputation, and deserving of being awarded fees commensurate with his experience.
- 5. My hourly rate for litigation is \$630 per hour.
- 6. I am informed that the rate he is seeking in this litigation is considerably lower. It is my opinion the rate he is seeking is very fair and reasonable for lawyers of his experience, skill and reputation, and reasonable in relation to hourly rates charged generally in Boston by attorneys of his skill and experience.

Signed under the pains and penalties of perjury this 9th day of August, 2006.

Thomas G. Shapiro





COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT NORTHERN DISTRICT

APPELLATE DIVISION CASE NO. 9937M

MOORE REAL ESTATE TRUST Plaintiff-Appellee,)
v.)
INDRALAKSHMI DIN-DAYAL Defendant-Appellant)

AFFIDAVIT OF BARRY C. KLICKSTEIN

- 1. I am a partner in the Boston office of Duane Morris LLP, a law firm of more than 600 lawyers.
- 2. I am a member of the Massachusetts and New York bars, having been admitted in 1973, my practice is limited to litigation in the State and Federal Courts.
- 3. I have had various occasions over the years to have cases with and against Mark Stern, and I believe him to be a first rate attorney with an excellent reputation.
- 4. Based on my knowledge and experience, a trial attorney of his experience in Boston would bill from \$500 to \$650 an hour.
- 5. I am informed that the rate he is seeking in this litigation is considerably lower, which would in my opinion be fair and reasonable for lawyers of his experience, skill and reputation, and reasonable in relation to hourly rates charged generally in Boston.

SIGNED UNDER THE PAINS AND PENALTIES OF PERJURY THIS 9^{TH} DAY OF AUGUST, 2006.

Barry C. Klickstein

my Cluchster





COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT NORTHERN DISTRICT

***************************************	•	
)	APPELLATE DIVISION
MOORE REAL ESTATE TRUST)	CASE NO. 9937M
Plaintiff-Appellee,)	
)	TRIAL COURT
v.)	CAMBRIDGE DIVISION OF
)	THE DISTRICT COURT DEPT.
INDRALAKSHMI DIN-DAYAL)	NO. 0452-SU-0672
Defendant-Appellant)	
)	

Document 32

AFFIDAVIT OF JOANNE C. FRAY

- I, JOANNE FRAY, swear under the pain and penalty of perjury that the following statements are true, accurate and complete, and known to me personally unless otherwise indicated to be known to me only on information and belief.
- 1. I am a graduate of Brandeis University (1960) and Northeastern University Law School (1977).
- 2. I was admitted to the following bars on the dates indicated hereafter:
 - (a) Commonwealth of Massachusetts (December 1977);
 - (b) U.S. District Court for Massachusetts; (September, . 1978)
 - (c) First Circuit Court of Appeals (April 1986);
 - (d) Supreme Court of the United States (April 5, 1993).
- 3. I have been actively engaged in the practice of law, since December of 1977. For 13 years before that time I was a teacher of high school English.

- 4. For all the time since I was admitted, I have been maintained my own in general practice firm handing, alone or with associates matters including, among others, litigation in employment discrimination, personal injury, special needs education, domestic relations, will contests, and contract disputes.
- 5. I have been involved in civil litigation in the Federal
 District court, Middlesex and Essex Superior courts, and regarding
 domestic relations and probate matters in the Probate and Family Courts in
 Suffolk, Middlesex, Essex, Norfolk, Hampden, Plymouth and Franklin
 counties as well as disputes before the MCAD and the Social Security
 Administration
- 6. I have been co-counsel with Attorney Mark Stern in matters in the Superior Court and, on one occasion, in Federal District Court.
- 7. I have known Attorney Mark D. Stern for many years. I have worked with him on several cases, all of which were concluded favorably to our clients.
- 8. Attorney Stern is a highly capable attorney, knowledgeable in the law and very skilled in dealing with discovery and evidentiary issues. He is a zealous, creative and thorough advocate with a proven record of success. He has an excellent reputation in the legal community.
- 9. In all of my work with Mr. Stern, I have been impressed, also, with his professionalism, high ethical standards and personal integrity.
- 9. In my opinion, based upon my familiarity with the legal services market in the Boston area, the hourly rate requested by Mr. Stern is reasonable and his fees of \$450.00 are well within the range of hourly rates charged by experienced attorneys.

p.3

Signed this 19th day of August, 2006 under the penalties of perjury..

Joanne C. Fray, BBO# 178060 Law Offices of Joanne C. Fray 1620 Massachusetts Avenue Lexington, MA 02420-3898 (781) 861-7195

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT

NORTHERN DISTRICT

APPELLATE DIVISION **CASE NO. 9937M**

ESTATE TRUST)	
ntiff-Appellee,) TRIAL CO	URT
) CAMBRID	GE DIVISION OF
) THE DISTR	RICT COURT DEPT
)	
II DIN-DAYAL) NO. 0452-S	SU-0672
endant-Appellant)	
) CAMBRIDO) THE DISTR) // NO. 0452-S	OGE DIVISION OF RICT COURT DE

AFFIDAVIT OF JOHN L. MASON, JR.

I swear under the penalty and pain of perjury that the following statements are true and accurate and known to me personally unless otherwise indicated to be known to me on information and belief.

- 1. I am a practicing lawyer in Belmont, Massachusetts with the firm of Mason & Goldman. I have been admitted and authorized to practice law in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts since September 11, 1969.
- 2. After my admission to the Bar in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts, I was employed by Cambridge and Somerville Legal Services from October 1969 to December 1982. I was a staff attorney, a managing attorney and a senior staff attorney in that office, specializing in private landlord-tenant relationships.
- 3. In that capacity I first met Mark D. Stern and had many opportunities to consult with him about client issues and observe him in legal proceedings. As a result of that contact and personal observations, I formed an extremely favorable opinion of Mr. Stern's advocacy skills and dedication to his clients.

- 4. Commencing in 1994, I began working on a series of cases with Mr. Stern which were particularly difficult and complex. These cases were both in the trial and appellate courts of the Commonwealth.
- 5. In one of these cases, we obtained a contempt judgment for approximately 120, mostly elderly clients living in formerly rent controlled housing in Brookline, Massachusetts. These cases required hearings both before the Single Justice and the Supreme Judicial Court. Mr. Stern handled most of the appellate work, and oral argument on each occasion. On each occasion we succeeded in obtaining or preserving the relief sought by our clients, notwithstanding the expiration of the rent control statute.
- 6. The Brookline series of cases demonstrated Mr. Stern's willingness to dedicate and in fact to dedicate several hundreds of hours of work to obtain the results for our clients. I found him to be willing to invest such efforts in what was in effect a contingency fee case, and in doing so, found that he made good judgments about the economical use of his time.
- 7. More recently an attorney from my office and I referred a case involving several clients to Mr. Stern, and continued thereafter to work with him as co-counsel. Mr. Stern achieved superb results for our clients in an economical fashion, first by presenting the issues effectively, then establishing the key facts through a series of short depositions, and finally by negotiating an arrangement by which our clients obtained all the relief they desired. On information and belief, I am advised the Defendant in that case recently sought out Mr. Stern's services.
- 8. As a result of my association with Mr. Stern since 1994, I have formed an even more favorable opinion of Mr. Stern's skills, professionalism and work habits. I observed his preparation for and performance in several lengthy trials and on several appeals. In my opinion, Mr. Stern is organized, diligent, articulate, persuasive, and a zealous and effective advocate. Mr. Stern deserves

9. As indicated above, I have been in private practice since 1983, and have several decades of experience in landlord-tenant cases. I am familiar with the challenges involved for a private practitioner representing a tenant of modest means or less in an eviction, retaliation and/or discrimination case. These type of cases are emotionally charged, hard-fought, difficult to settle, and require considerable time and energy which often prevents an attorney from taking on more lucrative matters. The challenges representing tenants on appeal from an unfavorable judgment are also considerable. As a consequence, I rarely if ever represent tenants in eviction matters and would never agree to do so on a contingency basis.

Signed this 4 day of August 2006,

John L. Mason, Jr.

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

I, Mark D. Stern, hereby certify under the pains and penalties of perjury that on this day I have caused to be delivered by regular course of mail, postage prepaid, a copy of the foregoing to

Signed,

Mark D. Stern

COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT

NORTHERN DISTRICT

	APPELLATE DIVISION CASE NO. 9937M
MOORE REAL ESTATE TRUST Plaintiff-Appellee, vs.))) TRIAL COURT) CAMBRIDGE DIVISION OF) THE DISTRICT COURT DEPT.
INDRALAKSHMI DIN-DAYAL Defendant-Appellant) NO. 0452-SU-0672)

AFFIDAVIT OF ANDREW M. FISCHER

- I, Andrew M. Fischer, do hereby affirm and attest as follows:
- 1. My name is Andrew M. Fischer and I am an attorney practicing law before the state and federal courts in Massachusetts.
- 2. I have practiced civil rights law for twenty six (26) years, having tried my first case under 42 USC §1983 in 1983 and have prosecuted numerous civil rights cases in Federal Court and have tried perhaps a dozen to jury verdict.
- 3. I am familiar with billing rates in the Boston, Framingham and eastern Massachusetts area and find that the \$450 an hour rate claimed by Attorney Mark Stern is not an unreasonable rate, within the mean for hourly rates charged by attorneys with comparable experience handling civil rights cases in the Federal Court.



- 4. I am familiar with Mark Stern, having known him for well over twenty years. He is more experienced than I and I consider him a mentor to whom I can turn with difficult questions. We have co-counseled cases, and I know him to be an experienced and able trial and appellate lawyer.
- I know that he has experience litigating a number of civil rights in the Federal Court and can attest that his hourly rate of \$450 an hour is a reasonable rate for an attorney of his knowledge and experience.

Signed and sworn under the pains and penalties of perjury this / day of August, 2006



COMMONWEALTH OF MASSACHUSETTS

APPELLATE DIVISION OF THE DISTRICT COURT DEPARTMENT

NORTHERN DISTRICT

APPELLATE DIVISION CASE NO. 9937M

TRIAL COURT
CAMBRIDGE DIVISION OF
THE DISTRICT COURT DEPT.
NO. 0452-SU-0672

AFFIDAVIT OF ATTORNEY JUDITH E. SOMBERG

- 1. I am an attorney admitted to the bar in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts in January 1977. I am a graduate of M.I.T. (B.S. 1973) and Northeastern University School of Law (J.D. 1976).
- 2. From 1977 until 1994 I was a partner in the firm of Johnson & Somberg (also Johnson, Somberg & Ross) in Boston, Massachusetts. Since 1994 I have been a solo practitioner in Cambridge.
- 3. My practice has changed over the years. Initially I was very involved in the representation of tenants and tenant unions. I also practiced in the area of personal injury law, social security disability, and workers compensation. I specialized in the representation of lead poisoned children. From time to time I represented individuals in employment and housing discrimination cases. As a solo practitioner I have slowly turned away from litigation and now do family law, wills and estates, and residential real estate.

- 5. For many years I was on a panel of attorneys who received financial support from the Lawyers Committee for Civil Rights for handling housing discrimination cases. They recognized that attorneys were reluctant to take on representation of victims of housing discrimination, even when statutory attorneys fees could be awarded, as cases often settled short of trial after significant time spent, or even when cases went to trial, adequate attorneys fees were not awarded.
- 6. Since 1994 I have collaborated as co-counsel with Mark Stern on several cases, including lead paint poisoning cases and sexual harassment cases.
 - 7. Working with Mr. Stern I was able to observe his skills and abilities as a litigator.
- 8. In my opinion Mr. Stern is an outstanding litigator. He is knowledgeable, smart, skillful, and hard working.
- 9. It is my opinion that Mr. Stern's legal work is comparable or superior to the work of litigators in the large Boston firms that I have come in contact with and deserves like compensation.
- 10. It is hard to find excellent, experienced attorneys who will represent tenants in disputes with landlords. Part of maintaining a client base includes having a network of good attorneys to refer clients to for types of cases that I do not handle. I am fortunate to be able to refer my clients or others who call with landlord tenant disputes to Mr. Stern.

Signed and sworn to under the pains and penalties of perjury this

14 day of

August, 2006.

Judith E Somberg 48 Antrim Street Cambridge, MA 02139

617-497-5364 BBO# 472880

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

1, Mark D. Stern, hereby certify under the pains and penalties of perjury that on this day I have caused to be delivered by regular course of mail, postage prepaid, a copy of the foregoing to

Signed,

Mark D. Stern

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT FOR THE DISTRICT OF MASSACHUSETTS

PAUL CUMMINGS,
Plaintiff
v.
STANDARD REGISTER COMPANY,
Defendant

NO. 99-CV-10368 RWZ

AFFIDAVIT OF ATTORNEY BENJAMIN HILLER

Benjamin Hiller, being duly sworn, hereby deposes and says as follows:

- 1. I am an attorney admitted to the bar in the Commonwealth of Massachusetts in 1979, and to the bar of this Court in 1980.
- 2. I have known and worked with attorney Mark Stern in a professional capacity since prior to my admission to the bar. I first worked with him in 1979 when I was a law student employed by his office. From October, 1980 until April, 1982 I was employed by the firm of Goldstein, Pressman and Stern, in which he was a partner. From April, 1982 until November, 1983 I was a partner of Mr. Stern's in the firm of Goldstein, Pressman, Stern & Hiller. Since November, 1983, I have had continued contact with Mr. Stern as consultants on each other's cases.
- 3. I have had the opportunity to work closely with Mr. Stern on a wide variety of civil cases. These have included the areas of labor law, medical malpractice, environmental law, sexual discrimination, lead poisoning, consumer protection, and landlord/tenant. This work has included analysis of issues, case development, discovery, trial preparation, settlement

EXHIBIT

negotiations, trial and appeal.

- 4. My current practice, with the firm of Moquin & Daley, involves almost exclusively the area of major personal injury cases. In the course of this practice I have had the opportunity to observe and have contact with attorneys from most of the major law firms in the City of Boston.
- In my opinion, Mr. Stern is one of the most intelligent, resourceful, hard working, and tenacious attorneys I have ever encountered. He has taken and pursued to extraordinarily successful conclusion not only the run of the mill cases, but the novel and difficult ones. Many of the cases in which he achieved dramatic success, either by way of verdict or settlement, were cases that most other competent attorneys would have been reluctant to take on because of the difficulty of the case, the low probability of success, or the lack of popularity of the client.
- 6. In my opinion, Mr. Stern's legal skills and his track record compare favorably with those of top litigators at the many large Boston firms with whom I have considerable contact in my current practice.

SIGN	ED UNDER THE PAINS AND PENALTIES OF PERJURY THIS _	155	DAY
OF _	Februs, 2000.		

kp41\hiller-aff

Benjamin Hiller, Esquire

CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

1 Mark D. Stern swear that on February 14, 2000 I have caused to be sent a true and accurate copy of the above by regular course of mail, postage prepaid, to the following counsel

Robert D. Rachlin Downs Rachlin & Martin 199 Main Street P.O. Box 190 Burlington, VT 05402



DONNA L. CONLEY 88 Bowen Avenue Medford, MA 02155 (781) 396-8590

BAR ADMISSION

Admitted to Massachusetts Bar, 1996 / Admitted to U.S. District Court (D. Massachusetts), 1997

EDUCATION

WESTERN NEW ENGLAND COLLEGE SCHOOL OF LAW

Springfield, MA J.D., May 1996

Activities: National Lawyers Guild Women's Law Association

BOSTON UNIVERSITY, College of Communication

Boston, MA

B.S., Mass Communication and Public Relations, May 1986

EXPERIENCE

Mark D. Stern, P.C.

March 2000 - February 2004

Somerville, MA

Associate

Motion practice for plaintiff-side labor and employment/personal injury firm. Assist with litigation and all aspects of trial preparation in busy law practice. Perform legal research and writing; handle discovery.

Law Office of Sherwin L. Kantrovitz, PC

September 1997 – December 1999

Boston, MA

<u>Associate</u>

Involved in all aspects of an employment litigation practice. Handled cases in both state and federal court. Employment discrimination, FMLA, FLSA, and ERISA cases. Heavy client contact. Motion practice. Heavy research and writing.

Alternative Solutions, Inc.

1996 - 1998

Boston, MA

Paralegal

Assigned to temporary assignments as litigation assistant. Assisted with pre-trial discovery.

Massachusetts Commission Against Discrimination

Spring 1996

Springfield, MA

Rule 3:03 Counsel

Represented complainants. Presented sexual harassment case at public hearing. Conducted direct and cross-examinations of witnesses; defended deposition.

Local 285, SEIU, Hospitals Division

Summer 1994

Boston, MA

1990 - 1993

Chief Steward

Coordinated the duties of ten stewards at the Harvard Community Health Plan Chapter. Handled employee grievances. Prepared cases for arbitration. Headed union negotiating committee.

SKILLS

LEXIS, WESTLAW, WordPerfect, MS Word, proficiency with the Internet, fluent in Spanish and French

PROFESSIONAL AFFILIATIONS

Massachusetts Bar Association, Labor & Employment Law Section

References available upon request



Elizabeth Clemons

1 South Shore Avenue Boston, MA 01960 (913) 488-5357 liz.clemons@gmail.com

SKILLS

Proficient in Microsoft Office Applications Adept with Internet Research and the Use of Online Databases Experienced in and Comfortable with Public Speaking

EDUCATION

2003 – 2006 Bachelor of Arts: Joint Honours Degree in Political Science and History

McGill University, Montreal, Quebec - Cumulative GPA: 3.37

Summer 2004 McGill University Summer in Italy

Centro Linguistico Italiano Dante Alighieri

- Intensive Beginner's Italian Course
- Cultural Immersion Program

2001 – 2003 International Baccalaureate Diploma High School Diploma, with High Honors

Shawnee Mission East High School, Prairie Village, Kansas

- National Merit Commendation

1999 – 2001 Attended The Barstow School of Kansas City, Missouri

- History Book Award, Outstanding Freshman History Student
- First Place in Kansas City, Third Place Nationally on National French Exam

WORK EXPERIENCE

2005 Summer; 2000 – 2003 Part-Time (during school year) and Summers Retail Associate

The Tennis Set, Prairie Village, Kansas

- Provided Assistance to Customers
- Sorted and Organized Incoming and Outgoing Shipments
- Provided Computer Assistance
- Created Unique Displays



Elizabeth Clemons

(514) 577-5677

1998 – 2003 Babysitter (Part-Time and Summer)

EXTRACURRICULAR AND VOLUNTEER EXPERIENCE

2002 - Member/Trustee, Board of Trustees

The Cornyn Foundation

- Philanthropic Organization
- Benefits Women, Children, and Elderly Persons in Need of Assistance

2004 - 2006 Daycare Volunteer

Students' Society of McGill University Daycare

- Volunteered in Toddler Classroom
- Organized Art Projects and Reading Hours
- Facilitated Creative Play and Learning

2004 – 2006 Member, International Students' Association of McGill University

McGill University

- Volunteered in Association-Sponsored Projects

2003 – 2006 Member, History Students' Association McGill University

2003 – 2006 Member, Political Science Students' Association McGill University

2003 – 2004 Member of Residence Council

Royal Victoria College Dormitory

- Helped Organize Various Social Functions

Fall of 2002 Teacher's Assistant

Briarwood Elementary School, Prairie Village, Kansas

- Provided Assistance in Grading
- Aided Students with Various Subjects
- Tutored English as a Second Language Students

AWARDS AND DISTINCTIONS

2003	International Baccalaureate Diploma
2002	National Honor Society Membership (commendation)

2002

Presidential Classroom Scholar, "Law and Justice in a

Democracy"

2001

First Place in Kansas City, Third Place Nationally on National

French

Exam

Elizabeth Clemons

(514) 577-5677

ACTIVITIES AND INTERESTS

Competitive Tennis Player with USTA Tournament Titles in Singles and Doubles, a Regional Ranking, and Three Varsity Letters. Named Most Dedicated Player in 1999 and Most Competitive Player in 2000 at The Barstow School.

Aggressive Soccer Player with Two Varsity Letters and Leading Scorer Distinction at The Barstow School.

Movies, Reading, Spectator Sports (raised as a Chicago Cubs fan)

[References Available on Request]



PERSONAL MONEY ORDER

6192336

53-447

DATE June 4, 2004

TO THE CLERK, UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT ORDER OF

PAY ONE HUNDRED FIFTY AND 00/100

150.00

PURCHASER BOYD M FULTON

CUSTOMER COPY

